

APPROVED MINUTES

JOINT MEETING of the STATE REVIEW BOARD and HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

March 21, 2013, 9:00 a.m.

**Main Floor Assembly Room, Brooks Hall, University Avenue,
University of Virginia, Charlottesville, VA 22904**

State Review Board Members Present

Dr. Elizabeth Moore, Chairperson
Dr. Laurant Lee, Vice-Chairperson
Joseph D. Lahendro
Dr. John Metz

Historic Resources Board Members Present

James Rich, Chairperson
William Garner
Terri Hauser
H. Edward "Chip" Mann
Lacy B. Ward, Jr.

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Kathleen Kilpatrick, Director
Marc Wagner
Lena Sweeten McDonald
Peter Luebke
Robert Carter
Gillian Bearn
Pam Schenian

Catherine Slusser
Julie Langan
Joanie Evans
Michael Pulice
Randy Jones
Jennifer Pullen

Guests present – Daniel Bluestone (UVA faculty); David Brown (Gloucester Woman's Club; Springdale); Bill Lesser (Walnut Grove); Frank Martos (Dulwich Manor); Debra McClane (Gretna Commercial HD); Michael Wildasin President, Board of Directors, Garth Newel Music Center).

Joint Meeting

Chair James Rich welcomed everyone in attendance. Director Kilpatrick introduced Brian Hogg, senior historic preservation planner with the Office of the Architect for the University of Virginia, who made a presentation about UVA's historic preservation management process including the donation of Brooks Hall to the University, the studies used to understand significant buildings and landscapes on campus, actions leading to LEED Gold certification of the rehabilitation of Garrett Hall, and both past and current rehabilitation/restoration work on the Rotunda.

Historic Resources Board (HRB)

Chair James Rich called the HRB meeting to order and welcomed everyone in attendance. He reminded visitors to sign in, particularly if they wanted to speak. He explained the role of the HRB and asked each member to introduce themselves. He then presented the December 2012 meeting minutes. With a motion from Ms. Hauser and a second from Mr. Ward, the HRB unanimously approved the minutes.

State Review Board (SRB)

Chair Elizabeth Moore called the SRB meeting to order and welcomed everyone in attendance. She explained the role of the SRB and the process of designation, and invited each member to introduce themselves. She then presented the December 2012 meeting minutes. With a motion from Mr. Lahendro and a second from Vice-Chair Lee, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the minutes. Chair Moore asked for a motion for the election of the SRB chair and vice-chair. Mr. Lahendro moved to nominate Moore and Lee to continue in their respective roles as Chair and Vice-Chair, and Dr. Metz seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Director's Report (DHR)

Director Kilpatrick reported on recent departmental staff actions, results of the recent General Assembly session, state and federal budget issues, agency accomplishments and upcoming events.

Mr. Wagner presented the following nominations for the Capital Region:

Dulwich Manor, Amherst County, #163-5020, Criterion C

Downtown Hopewell Historic District Nomination Update and Boundary Adjustment, 2013, City of Hopewell, #116-5031, Criteria A and C

Hyde Park, Nottoway County, #067-0040, Criteria A and C

Rivermont Historic District Boundary Increase to include St. John's Episcopal Church, 2013, City of Lynchburg, #118-0334, Criteria A and C

Comments made:

Property owner Frank Martos answered board questions regarding Dulwich Manor and spoke on behalf of the nomination.

Mr. Dave Brown answered questions and spoke on behalf of the Hyde Park nomination.

With a motion from Mr. Ward and a second from Mr. Garner, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

With a motion from Mr. Lahendro and a second from Vice-Chair Lee, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

Ms. Langan presented the following nomination for the Northern Region:

Garth Newel, Bath County, #008-5041, Criteria A and C, Criteria Consideration G

Comments made:

Mr. Michael Wildasin spoke on behalf of the nomination.

With a motion from Ms. Hauser and a second from Mr. Mann, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

With a motion from Vice-Chair Lee and a second from Dr. Metz, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

Ms. Evans presented the following nomination for the Northern Region:

Arcola Elementary School, Loudoun County, #053-0982, Criteria A and C

Charles M. Goodman House, City of Alexandria, #100-5265, Criteria B and C

Hawthorne and Old Town Spring, City of Winchester, #138-0030 and 138-5013, Criteria A, B, and C

Locust Grove/R. E. Luttrell Farmstead, Rappahannock County, #078-5095, Criteria A and C

Walnut Grove, City of Waynesboro, #136-0404, Criterion C

Comments made:

Chair Rich opened the floor to public comment. One of the property owners of Walnut Grove, Bill Lesser, spoke on behalf of its nomination. Dr. Daniel Bluestone spoke on behalf of the Goodman House.

With a motion from Mr. Mann and a second from Ms. Hauser, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

With a motion from Dr. Metz and a second from Mr. Lahendro, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

Ms. Schenian presented the following nomination for the Tidewater Region:

Gloucester Woman's Club 2013 Update, Gloucester County, #036-0031, Criteria A, C, and D

Springdale, Mathews County, #057-0018, Criterion C

Waverly Downtown Historic District, Sussex County, #323-5019, Criteria A and C

Comments made:

Chair Rich opened the floor to public comment. No one spoke from the audience.

With a motion from Mr. Mann and a second from Mr. Ward, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

With a motion from Vice-Chair Lee and a second from Mr. Lahendro, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

Mr. Pulice presented the following nomination for the Western Region:

Christiansburg Downtown Historic District, Montgomery County, #154-5025, Criteria A and C
Glade Spring Commercial Historic District, Washington County, #222-0001, Criteria A and C
Gretna Commercial Historic District, Pittsylvania County, #227-5002, Criteria A and C
Narrows Commercial Historic District, Giles County, #266-0021, Criteria A and C

Comments made:

The Narrows Commercial Historic District was removed from the consent agenda to be discussed and voted on separately.

With a motion from Mr. Garner and a second from Mr. Ward, the HRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

With a motion from Mr. Mann and a second from Mr. Garner, the HRB then voted to exclude the non-historic age resources in the Narrows Commercial Historic District nomination, as listed in Giles County's written communication to DHR. The HRB voted to approve the nomination as amended, with one abstention (Ms. Hauser).

After excluding the Narrows Commercial Historic District, with a motion from Mr. Lahendro and a second from Dr. Metz, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

With a motion from Mr. Lahendro and a second from Dr. Metz, the SRB voted unanimously to approve the Narrows Commercial HD nomination with the same exclusions as approved by the HRB.

With a motion from Mr. Ward and second from Mr. Mann, Chair Rich adjourned the HRB meeting at 12:44 p.m. With a motion from Vice-Chair Lee and a second from Mr. Lahendro, Chair Moore adjourned the SRB meeting.

AFTERNOON SESSION

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

Historic Resources Board Members Present

James Rich, Chairperson
William Garner
Terri Hauser
H. Edward "Chip" Mann
Lacy B. Ward, Jr.

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Kathleen Kilpatrick
Joanna Wilson Green
Peter Luebke
Megan Melinat
Wendy Musumeci
Jennifer Pullen
Elizabeth Tune

Chair Rich called the HRB meeting to order at 2:37 p.m.

HIGHWAY MARKERS

Mr. Luebke noted that the James Solomon Russell marker (#4) was pulled from the agenda and then presented the following highway markers:

Sponsor Markers

1. Garth Newel

Sponsor Markers/Diversity

2. Bishop Payne Divinity School

3. C. W. Seay (ca. 1900-1982)

DHR Markers/Diversity

4. Letitia Pate Whitehead Evans (ca. 1870-1953)

5. Mary Johnston (1870-1936)

Comments Made:

Marker #1: Garth Newel

Mr. Michael Wildasin, President of the Board of Directors of the Garth Newel Music Center spoke on behalf of the marker and about the question of including the names of Luca and Arlene DiCecco as cofounders of the Music Center on the marker..

Mr. Ward made a motion to approve the marker, with the condition that the word “found” be changed to “co-found” in the marker text. Mr. Mann seconded the motion. The HRB voted unanimously to approve marker #1. Mr. Garner requested a copy of the marker policy.

Markers #2, #3, and #6:

With a motion from Mr. Mann and a second from Mr. Garner, the HRB voted unanimously to approve markers #2, #3, and #6.

Marker #5: Letitia Pate Whitehead Evans

Mr. Luebke requested that the HRB approve marker #5 with latitude for staff to adjust the marker text once it received additional information from the Coca-Cola Archives. Mr. Luebke noted the marker was essentially complete, but information from Coca-Cola may result in a minor change. Director Kilpatrick added that the HRB could approve the concept of the marker and staff could tweak the language as necessary. With a motion from Ms. Hauser and a second from Mr. Mann, the HRB voted unanimously to approve marker #5 with one absention (Mr. Ward).

EASEMENTS

New Easement Projects for Consideration

Ms. Musumeci noted that Item #12: Walnut Grove was pulled from the agenda due to legal issues associated with the property being held in a Trust with minor beneficiaries, and then presented the following new easements for consideration:

1. Prillaman (Gabriel Jones) Farm, Port Republic Battlefield, Rockingham County
2. Lee-Jackson Hotel (Strayer House), New Market H.D. & Battlefield, Shenandoah County
3. Gilbert’s Corner Regional Park, Aldie Battlefield, Loudoun County
4. Gibson Property, Second Manassas Battlefield, Prince William County
5. Wotring Tract, Second Manassas Battlefield, Prince William County
6. Troilo Tract, Brandy Station Battlefield, Culpeper County
7. Quail Haven Farm, Kelly’s Ford Battlefield, Culpeper County
8. Cooper Parcel, Chancellorsville Battlefield, Spotsylvania County

9. Kronenwetter Tract, Chancellorsville Battlefield, Spotsylvania County
10. Liles (Crewe House) Tract, Malvern Hill Battlefield, Henrico County
11. Mansfield Group LLC Tract, Deep Bottom I and Glendale Battlefields, Henrico County
- ~~12. Walnut Grove, City of Waynesboro~~
13. Lee Hall Depot, City of Newport News

Comments Made:

There were no comments from the audience.

With a motion from Mr. Ward and a second from Ms. Hauser, the HRB voted unanimously to approve Items #1-#13, with #12 removed from the agenda.

Easement Assignment for Consideration

1. **Ramseur's Hill Tract, Fisher's Hill Battlefield, Shenandoah County**
Property Owner: Shenandoah Valley Battlefields Foundation
Easement Holder: Virginia Outdoors Foundation
Acres: 194

Comments Made:

There were no comments from the audience.

With a motion from Mr. Ward and a second from Ms. Hauser, the HRB voted unanimously to approve Easement Assignment #1.

Easements Recorded Since the December 2012 Meeting

Ms. Musumeci briefed the HRB on the following:

1. Potts Fitzhugh House (Robert E. Lee Boyhood Home), City of Alexandria
Date Recorded: 12/26/13
Donor: Mark J. Kington and Ann K. Kington
Acres: 0.258
2. Old Stone House, City of Richmond
Date Recorded: 01/07/13
Donor: Association for the Preservation of Virginia Antiquities (Preservation Virginia)
Acres: 0.114
3. Hudson Property, Cedar Creek Battlefield, Frederick and Warren Counties
Date Recorded: 01/17/13
Donor: Belle Grove, Inc.
Acres: 11.016

With a motion from Ms. Hauser and a second from Mr. Garner, the HRB adjourned at 3:54 p.m.

STATE REVIEW BOARD

Chair Moore called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m. in the Visitor's Room at the Rotunda of the University of Virginia, Charlottesville, for discussion and consideration of the Preliminary Information Applications (informal guidance session).

State Review Board Members Present

Dr. Elizabeth Moore, Chairperson
Dr. Luranett Lee, Vice-Chairperson
Joseph D. Lahendro
Dr. John Metz

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Marc Wagner
Lena McDonald
Joanie Evans
Pam Schenian
Michael Pulice

Guests (from sign in sheet)

Marcus Pollard, re: Alicia Hopkins House
Bryan Clark Green, re: Chesapeake Warehouses and Cigarette Industry in Richmond
David Brown
Veda Headley, re: Helmley
Paul Lavigne, re: John Wesley United Methodist Church

Preliminary Information Applications

The following proposals were *endorsed*, unless otherwise noted, with the following comments which are included here to help guide the applicant in completing a full nomination report:

Western Region.....presented by Michael Pulice

Byars Cobb House/Woodburn, Washington County, #222-5001, Criterion C

Mr. Wagner asked if there are photos of the original porch and Mr. Pulice said there are photos of a historic porch but it may not have been original as its decorative elements appear to date from the Victorian era. The SRB recommended the nomination to proceed.

First Baptist Church, City of Bristol, #102-0015, Criterion C and Criteria Consideration A

Chair Moore asked if the organ is original to the building and if the church was built to accommodate it or retrofitted for it. Mr. Pulice did not know. Mr. Lahendro asked what is known of the architect. Mr. Pulice said he was based in Bristol after an internship in Roanoke. He designed numerous churches, schools, and other institutional buildings. Mr. Lahendro said it would be interesting to know how the design of this church relates to other monumental churches in the region. The SRB recommended the nomination to proceed.

Mechanicsville Historic District, City of Danville, #108-5607, Criteria A and C

Chair Moore asked if this was an expansion of an existing district. Mr. Pulice said the district previously was evaluated as eligible but a nomination was not submitted. The new PIF was submitted to expand the proposed boundaries to include additional contributing resources and the SRB would need to approve the reconfigured boundaries. The SRB recommended the nomination to proceed with the reconfigured boundaries.

Northern Region.....presented by Joanie Evans

Helmley, Clarke County, #021-0041, Criteria A and C

Dr. Metz asked about the siding on the front of the house. Property owner Veda Headley said it is called Williamsburg siding and is still extant. The back of the house is stone. Mr. Lahendro asked what will be emphasized in the nomination form. Ms. Evans said the original architectural features will be highlighted, especially because they are not seen on many other properties in the vicinity. Mr. Lahendro said the unusual characteristics (for the region) would be important. Mrs. Headley said most of the settlers in the area were Quakers, but the settlers at Helmley came from the Tidewater. Mrs. Headley said the only major alterations to the property consisted of putting three bedrooms and a bath in the previously unfinished attic. The SRB recommended the nomination to proceed.

John Wesley United Methodist Church, Bath County, #008-5030, Criteria A and C

Mr. Paul Lavigne explained how the Valley Program for the Aging acquired the former church for use as a senior center. The fellowship hall was renovated to house activities and programs for local senior citizens. The original church building has not been altered. Mr. Lahendro asked about the fellowship hall and how it is connected to the church building. Ms. Evans said an original window opening in the church building was used as a doorway to connect the church building to the hyphen and

fellowship hall. Mr. Lahendro noted this makes the addition a reversible alteration. Mr. Lavigne said the driveway and parking lot had been landscaped to protect the rural setting. Mr. Lahendro said the retention of the pews and original woodwork are important to the integrity of the church and should be noted in the nomination. Mr. Lavigne said the community has resisted renovating the church for activities and prefers restoring the church more to its original appearance. Chair Moore asked if the altar rail is intact, and Mr. Lavigne said yes. Chair Moore said the Czech Church nominated last year had a hyphen and wing addition similar to this one, so that nomination might be a useful model. Mr. Lahendro asked for more research on the church's role in the local African American community. Vice-Chair Lee asked if former church members are involved with the nomination. Mr. Lavigne said yes. Vice-Chair Lee suggested funding may be available through the Virginia Foundation for the Humanities for an oral history program. Mr. Lavigne said the Bath County Historical Society has provided some historical information. Vice-Chair Lee also suggested getting more information on the cemetery and defining its boundaries. The The SRB recommended the nomination to proceed.

Winchester Historic District 2013 Update and Boundary Increase, City of Winchester, #138-0042, Criteria A and C
The SRB recommended the nomination to proceed.

Tidewater Region.....presented by Pam Schenian

Alicia Hopkins House, Accomack County, #273-0001-0156, Criteria B and C

Consultant Marcus Pollard said the house's contributing status in a historic district has weighed against it for individual listing. The property owners wrote the community history that was used to prepare the historic district nomination. The house is a prominent visual landmark on the waterfront and the lot remains as originally platted. Mr. Pollard requested a written policy or guidance about whether a property in a listed historic district can or cannot be individually nominated, and for what reasons. Mr. Lahendro asked if documentation exists for the Hopkins House's original kitchen and colonnade. Mr. Pollard said some photographs are available but nothing extensive. The work was done in the 1980s prior to the acquisition of the property by the present owners. The new kitchen's footprint exactly matches the original section. Chair Moore said that lacking a written policy about nominating individual properties within districts, the property should be evaluated on its own merits. Mr. Lahendro said he thought DHR staff had done so. Mr. Pollard said the Hopkins family was key to the development of the town's waterfront and they occupied the Hopkins house while doing so. Mr. Lahendro said a guidance statement should say that something exceptional outside the district's significance would be expected. The SRB recommended the nomination not to proceed.

Amblers, James City County, #047-0043, Criteria C and D

The property is within the Governor's Land Archaeological District, however, that nomination's period and areas of significance do not encompass this property so it is a non-contributing resource in the district. The property is individually eligible in its own right. The archaeological resources date to the period of the extant dwelling and an earlier dwelling known to have been on the site. Chair Moore wanted to see archaeological resources discussed more fully in the nomination. Mr. Lahendro said the architectural character is marginal, and the nomination should indicate how much of the original fabric is extant versus the twentieth century materials. The SRB recommended the nomination to proceed.

Capital Region.....presented by Lena McDonald

Chesapeake Warehouses, City of Richmond, #127-6720, Criteria A and C

Consultant Bryan Green said the original owners were in the China tobacco trade during the 1920s after Duke's tobacco monopoly was broken. They had been tobacco farmers and became brokers. Mr. Lahendro said appreciating the tobacco facilities would be based on their design and engineering and is readily apparent with these buildings. The SRB recommended the nomination to proceed.

Tobacco Industry in Richmond Multiple Property Documentation Form, #127-6722, Criteria A and C

Dr. Metz asked if the MPD's context research had uncovered links to other industrial design processes besides Henry Ford. Mr. Green said that such links had not been uncovered yet. Mr. Green said the tobacco-processing related properties from the mid- to late nineteenth century are located north of the James River. The processing/storage process took place within a single multi-story building. By the early twentieth century, horizontally massed production facilities began to be used to increase efficiency. Middle men joined the manufacturing process. Resources related to this period are generally located south of the James River. Faster rail lines were available here as well, compared to north of the river. The use of blended

tobaccos required large storage facilities for housing a variety of tobaccos until they were ready to use. Chair Moore asked if tobacco-related twentieth-century contexts had been developed in other states. Mr. Green said he had found none, although there were a number of contexts for nineteenth-century resources. The Danville Warehouse and Tobacco Row (Richmond) nominations have some helpful context information. The period of significance for the MPD ends in the mid-1960s after the Surgeon General's warning about tobacco smoking and as production began to be off-shored. Vice-Chair Lee asked if any of the facilities south of the James are in the Manchester Historic District, and Mr. Green said no. Ms. McDonald said that the Manchester district's boundaries had been carefully examined during its recent nomination update and that the tobacco-related resources are too far physically from the boundaries to be included. Chair Moore asked where the workers lived when the tobacco plants were active. Mr. Green said there were worker housing neighborhoods, primarily African American, in the vicinity but they have not been documented. Chair Moore suggested that adding a social history context to the MPD would be appropriate, if not now then at a future date as associated resources are documented. The SRB recommended the MPD to proceed.

Deep Run Hunt Club, City of Richmond, #127-6721, Criteria A and C

Chair Moore asked if Criterion A was very strong, and Ms. McDonald said the historic record provided documentation on the hunt club's role in Richmond's social history. The club continues to exist today, which the evaluation committee felt was worth noting. The SRB recommended the nomination to proceed.

Chair Moore adjourned the SRB meeting at 4:45 p.m.